

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Kevin Brigley and Stephen Chase, Maintenance Supervisor (PC1663U), Bergen County

CSC Docket Nos. 2017-2188 2017-2151 **Examination Appeals**

ISSUED: MAY 1 9 2017

(RE)

Kevin Brigley and Stephen Chase appeal the decisions of the Division of Agency Services (DAS) which found that they did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Maintenance Supervisor (PC1663U), Bergen County. These appeals have been consolidated due to common issues.

The examination at issue was announced with specific requirements that had to be met as of the August 22, 2016 closing date. [See attachment] Two candidates appear on the eligible list, which has been certified once, but no appointments have yet been made.

Both appellants met the five years of general experience requirement, but did not meet the two years of supervisory experience. On appeal, the appellants argue that over the years they have taken the lead position in the absence of the supervisors. Mr. Brigley adds that he has eight months of full-time supervision responsibility, and Mr. Chase argues that he has 10 years of supervisory experience over outside contractors, employees within his electrical company, and supervision in the absence of the supervisor.

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a)2 states that applicants for promotional examinations must meet all requirements by the announced closing date.

CONCLUSION

In order for experience to be considered applicable, it must have as its primary focus full-time responsibilities in the areas required in the announcement. See In the Matter of Bashkim Vlashi (MSB, decided June 9, 2004). Additionally, supervisory experience includes responsibility for seeing that tasks assigned to subordinates are efficiently accomplished. It involves independent assignment and distribution of work to employees, with oral or written task instructions, and maintenance of the flow and quality of work within a unit in order to assure timely and effective fulfillment of objectives. Supervisors are responsible for making available or obtaining materials, supplies, equipment, and/or plans necessary for particular tasks. Also, they provide on-the-job training to subordinates, when needed, and make employee performance evaluations based on their own judgment. They have authority to recommend hiring, firing, and disciplining of employees. Further, the supervisory experience must have been over subordinates performing the announced experience requirement, in this case, the construction or repair and maintenance of buildings and grounds.

Mr. Brigley received credit for three months of supervisory experience in his provisional position from June 2016 to the August 2016 closing date. He indicated that he supervised employees when he was a Sales Associate at Home Depot; however, this experience is not qualifying as the staff were not involved in the construction repair and maintenance of buildings and grounds. He also indicated that he supervised staff while in the title Senior Maintenance Repairer. In his description of duties, he indicated that he assumed the duties and responsibilities of the supervisor while he was on military leave. Nonetheless, this is not qualifying experience. First, it is not a supervisory title, and therefore if he supervised while in this title, it is considered out-of-title work and cannot be used to satisfy eligibility Next, the appellant was not performing all the duties of a supervisor, such as making employee performance evaluations. Moreover, even assuming this experience could be accepted, Mr. Brigley only indicated that he filled in for his supervisor in February 2016 and from April to May 2016. Thus, he would still need an additional one year and seven months of supervisory experience to qualify for the examination. He did not supervise staff in his remaining positions.

On his application, Mr. Chase indicated that he supervised employees while in his position as owner of an electric company. This supervision is not applicable as his subordinates were performing commercial electrical work, not the construction or repair and maintenance of buildings and grounds. He indicated that he supervised while in the titles Senior Electrician with Bergen County and Senior Electrical Technician with Teaneck. Official records indicate that the appellant's titles when he worked at Teaneck were Electrician and Laborer 1. Again, these are non-supervisory titles, and the duties listed do not indicate that the appellant was actually performing supervisory duties in these positions. He did not supervise

staff in his remaining position as Electrician with New Jersey Transit. In sum, Mr. Brigley lacks one year, nine months of applicable supervisory experience, while Mr. Chase lacks two years of applicable supervisory experience.

An independent review of all material presented indicates that the decisions of DAS that the appellants did not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date is amply supported by the record. The appellants provide no basis to disturb these decisions. Thus, the appellants have failed to support their burden of proof in this matter.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that these appeals be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 17th DAY OF MAY, 2017

+ M. Gech

Robert M. Czech

Chairperson

Civil Service Commission

Inquiries

and

Correspondence

Director

Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs

Civil Service Commission Written Record Appeals Unit

P. O. Box 312

Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

Attachment

c: Kevin Brigley 2017-2188 Stephen Chase 2017-2151 Robert Laux Kelly Glenn Records Center NEW JERSEY CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION COUNTY AND MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT SERVICES PROMOTIONAL ANNOUNCEMENT



Click here to file Online \$25.00 PROCESSING FEE REQUIRED Make Check/Money Order Payable to NJCSC

SYMBOL: PC1663U

TITLE: MAINTENANCE SUPERVISOR

ISSUE DATE: August 01, 2016 TITLE CODE: 02387/ H4RBR1 JURISDICTION: BERGEN COUNTY DEPARTMENT: UTILITIES AUTHORITY WEIGHT CODE: *

SALARY: \$63,798.00 - \$110,907.00

CLOSING DATE: August 22, 2016

JURISDICTION CODE: N02000400

Visit www.state.nj.us/csc And select "Job Announcements" to view this announcement and to file an application

Open to employees in the competitive division who have an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date and are currently serving in the following title(s):

Assistant Maintenance Supervisor 00604

Or to employees in the competitive division who have an aggregate of one year of continuous permanent service as of the closing date in any competitive title and meet the requirements listed below:

Experience: Five (5) years of experience in work involving the construction or repair and maintenance of building and grounds, two (2) years of which shall have been in

License: Appointees must possess a driver's license valid in the State of New Jersey. Proof of license must be submitted to appointing authority prior to appointment.

The responsibility for ensuring that employees possess the required motor vehicle license, commensurate with the class and type of vehicles they operate, rests with the Appointing Authority

IMPORTANT INFORMATION

- 1. NJAC 4A:4-2.6 states that all requirements listed must be met as of the closing date, including assignment to jurisdiction/department, and satisfying the permanent status requirement.
- 2. ONLY ON-LINE APPLICATIONS WILL BE ACCEPTED. YOU MUST COMPLETE YOUR APPLICATION IN DETAIL. Your score may be based on a comparison of your credentials with the job requirements. Failure to complete your application properly may lower your score or cause you to fail.

 3. This examination is open to full-time and part-time permanent employees. If an employment list results from this announcement, it may be certified to fill both full-time and part-time positions. If 35- and 40-hour positions are used within the department, the resulting list may be used to fill either work week position.

- time and part-time positions. If 35- and 40-hour positions are used within the department, the resulting list may be used to fill either work week position.

 4. NJAC 4A:4-1.5 states that any employee who is serving on a provisional basis and who fails to file for and take an examination which has been announced for his/her title SHALL BE SEPARATED FROM THE PROVISIONAL TITLE.

 5. In accordance with Public Law 2010 c.26, Veterans pay a reduced application fee of \$15.00 if they have previously established Veterans Preference with the DMAVA (as defined by N.J.S.A. 11A:5-1 et seq.), or your claim is approved by DMAVA at least 8 days prior to the issuance of this eligibility list. PLEASE NOTE THIS REDUCED FEE DOES NOT APPLY TO PUBLIC SAFETY TITLES. (i.e. Police, Fire, Corrections and Sheriff).

 6. If you are having difficulty submitting your application online, technical support and customer care are available during regular business hours, 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. EST, Monday Friday, excluding holidays and emergency closings. Please Email: OAS.support@csc.state.nj.us or call (609) 292-4144. Please note that application support requests received outside of regular business hours on the closing date will not change the application filing deadline, so PLEASE FILE FARLY. EARLY.

DPF-256A * Revised 03/09