

Agenda Date: 6/29/16 Agenda Item: 2F

# STATE OF NEW JERSEY Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350 www.nj.gov/bpu/

# **ENERGY**

I/M/O OF THE PETITION OF SJP RESIDENTIAL PROPERTIES, LLC FOR A WAIVER OF B.P.U. NO. 15 GAS, ORIGINAL SHEET NO. 22 STANDARD TERMS AND CONDITIONS NO. 8.3.1 DECISION AND ORDER

DOCKET NO. 'GW16040290

Parties of Record:

Michael K. Plumb, Esq., Chiesa Shahinian & Giantomasi PC, representing SJP Residential Properties Alex Stern, Esq., Public Service Electric & Gas Company Stephanie A. Brand, Director, New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel

BY THE BOARD:

# BACKGROUND:

On April 12, 2016, the Board received a petition for waiver of Public Service Electric and Gas Company's ("PSE&G") tariff, B.P.U.N.J. No. 15 Gas, Original Sheet No. 22 Standard Terms and Conditions No. 8.3.1, which requires individual meters for gas in residential buildings, with some exceptions that do not apply here. The Petitioner, SJP Residential Properties, LLC (the "Petitioner") is a developer and investor in Fort Lee Phase II Urban Renewal Associates, LLC, which is funding a project known as The Modern Phase II. The Modern Phase II is a 450-unit apartment building in a single tower currently under construction in Fort Lee, NJ. Petitioner intends to pay for all residential gas consumption for The Modern Phase II, which will only be used for cooktops.

Petitioner asserts that requiring individual metering at The Modern Phase II would cause significant hardship without any countervailing benefit. Petitioner asserts that the use of gas in The Modern Phase II is <u>de minimis</u> because it is only needed for cooktop gas service;<sup>1</sup> conservation would not be adversely affected by granting Petitioner's waiver; and there is significant cost to the Petitioner to individually meter the building. Specifically, the cost to meter each individual apartment would be approximately \$2,000 per meter while gas usage per apartment is expected to be approximately \$1.10 per month.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Modern Phase II's ovens, microwave ovens, heat, and air conditioning will be powered by electricity.

# PSE&G

On April 21, 2016, PSE&G submitted a letter to the Board stating that if the Board determines that the best course of action is to grant the Petitioner's waiver request, PSE&G would be guided by such determination. Its letter did not assert any objection to the Petition.

## Rate Counsel

On May 11, 2016, New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel ("Rate Counsel") submitted a letter to the Board stating its position that a waiver of the tariff provision appears appropriate. Rate Counsel cited that individual gas meters would appear to be impractical and costly for both the developer and the tenants of the building. In addition to the cost to the developer of installing meters, individual metering would subject each tenant to PSE&G's fixed customer charge, currently \$5.84 per month. The cost of providing cooktop gas to the building is expected to be about \$1.10 per unit per month. Under these specific circumstances, Rate Counsel posits that a single master meter would be the more practical approach. Additionally, in view of the minimal natural gas usage required to operate cooktops, Rate Counsel asserts it appears unlikely that individual metering for gas would result in any substantial energy savings.

## **DISCUSSION AND FINDINGS**:

B.P.U.N.J. No. 15 Gas, Original Sheet No. 22 Standard Terms and Conditions No. 8.3.1 states that the "service and supply of gas by Public Service for the use of owners, landlords, tenants, or occupants of residential buildings or premises will be furnished to them as customers of Public Service through Public Service individual meters, except as noted..." Sub-metering of residential service is prohibited by the Board. See I/M/O Boards Investigation Into the Check Metering of Gas Service, Docket No. GX85090901 (September 5, 1986); See also, I/M/O Petition of Marine View Plaza Apartments for a Declaratory Ruling Permitting Check-Metering, Docket No. EO99040252, Order Denying Motion (March 30, 2001).

The circumstances of this case create a unique circumstance given that the cost to meter each individual apartment is \$2,000 for the <u>de minimis</u> use of gas estimated to be \$1.10 per unit per month. Additionally, as noted by Rate Counsel the monthly bill to these customers would include an additional \$5.84 customer charge, essentially charging each tenant a six fold rate for gas service.

Having reviewed this matter, the Board <u>FINDS</u> that the waiver of the above referenced Tariff is appropriate under the present circumstances. Therefore, the Board <u>HEREBY</u> <u>APPROVES</u> SJP Residential Property's request for waiver with the following conditions:

The Boards prohibitions on sub-metering remain in full force and are not waived by or through this order;

This waiver applies only to this Petition.

Petitioner or any subsequent owner is not permitted to install or operate any meter, measuring device or sub-meter designed to measure the gas service used by individual tenants or otherwise allocate gas usage to individual apartments;

This order shall be null and void and of no effect and any gas service permitted hereto shall be terminated if any such sub-metering or alternative measuring device is installed or usage so allocated to tenants;

This order shall be null and void and of no effect and any gas service permitted hereto shall be terminated if Petitioner or any subsequent owner attaches any appliances other than cooktop gas service as described in the petition to individual units or otherwise attach any other device using gas service to the building.

In addition, the Board <u>HEREBY</u> <u>DIRECTS</u> the gas distribution companies, in their next base rate proceeding, to revisit their tariffs to allow for a single meter for the supply of <u>de minimus</u> amounts of gas, such as for cooking gas.

The Order shall be effective on July 9, 2016.

DATED: 6

BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES BY:

ARD S. MROZ RESIDENT

JOSEPH L. FIORDALISO COMMISSIONER

ARY-ANNA COMMISSIONER

DIANNE SÕLOMON COMMISSIONER

ATTEST: IRENE KIM ASBURY SECRETARY

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the within document is a true copy of the original in the files of the Board of Public Utilities

UBENDRA J. CHIVUKULA COMMISSIONER

110010101010104003165

3

### I/M/O OF THE PETITION OF SJP RESIDENTIAL PROPERTIES, LLC FOR A WAIVER OF B.P.U. NO. 15 GAS, ORIGINAL SHEET NO. 22 STANDARD TERMS AND CONDITIONS NO. 8.3.1 BPU DOCKET NO. GW16040290

### SERVICE LIST

#### **SJP Residential Properties:**

John G. Valeri, Esq. Chiesa Shahinian & Giantomasi PC 1 Boland Drive West Orange, NJ 07052

Jeffrey S. Chiesa, Esq. Chiesa Shahinian & Giantomasi PC 1 Boland Drive West Orange, NJ 07052

Michael K. Plumb, Esq. Chiesa Shahinian & Giantomasi PC 1 Boland Drive West Orange, NJ 07052

### DAGs:

Geoffrey R. Gersten, Esq. Department of Law & Public Safety Division of Law 124 Halsey Street Post Office Box 45029 Newark, NJ 07101-45029 geoffrey.gersten@dol.lps.state.nj.us

Caroline Vachier, Esq. Department of Law & Public Safety Division of Law 124 Halsey Street Post Office Box 45029 Newark, NJ 07101-45029 Caroline.vachier@dol.lps.state.nj.us

### Rate Counsel:

Stefanie A. Brand, Esq., Director Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003 <u>sbrand@rpa.state.nj.us</u>

### **Board of Public Utilities:**

Paul Flanagan, Esq. Executive Director Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 paul.flanagan@bpu.state.nj.us

Irene Kim Asbury, Esq. Secretary of the Board Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 <u>Irene.asbury@bpu.state.nj.us</u>

Jerome May, Director Division of Energy Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 jerome.may@bpu.state.nj.us

Cynthia Covie, Esq. Chief Counsel Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 <u>cynthia.covie@bpu.state.nj.us</u>

Maureen Wagner, Esq. Counsel's Office Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 <u>maureen.wagner@bpu.state.nj.us</u> Brian O. Lipman Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003 <u>blipman@rpa.state.nj.us</u>

Sarah H. Steindel, Esq. Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003 <u>ssteindel@rpa.state.nj.us</u>

Felicia Thomas-Friel, Esq. Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003 <u>fthomas-friel@rpa.state.nj.us</u>

Shelly Massey, Paralegal Division of Rate Counsel 140 East Front Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Post Office Box 003 Trenton, NJ 08625-0003 <u>Smassey@rpa.state.ni.us</u> Eric Hartsfield, Director Division of Customer Assistance Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 eric.hartsfield@bpu.ni.gov

Stacy Peterson Division of Energy Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 Stacy.peterson@bpu.nj.gov

#### PSE&G:

Alexander Stern, Esq. PSE&G Services Corp. 80 Park Plaza – T5 Post Office Box 570 Newark, NJ 07102 <u>Alexander.stern@pseg.com</u>

Joseph F. Accardo, Jr., Esq. PSE&G Services Corp. 80 Park Plaza – T5 Post Office Box 570 Newark, NJ 07102 Joseph.accardo@pseg.com

5