

Agenda Date: 5/8/19 Agenda Item: VIIA

# STATE OF NEW JERSEY

Board of Public Utilities 44 South Clinton Avenue, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Suite 314 Post Office Box 350 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0350 <u>www.nj.gov/bpu/</u>

KATHLEEN RUTLER,

Petitioner,

#### CUSTOMER ASSISTANCE

ORDER ADOPTING

PUBLIC SERVICE ELECTRIC AND GAS COMPANY, Respondent.

۷.

BPU DOCKET NO. EC18101100U OAL DOCKET NO. PUC 00217-19

Parties of Record:

Kathleen Rutler, Petitioner, pro se Danielle Lopez, Esq., Assistant General Regulatory Counsel, for Respondent

BY THE BOARD:

### PROCEDURAL HISTORY

By petition filed with the Board of Public Utilities ("Board") on October 9, 2018, ("Petition"), Kathleen Rutler ("Petitioner") disputed charges associated with service provided by Public Service Electric & Gas Company ("Respondent").

In her Petition, Petitioner stated that she was incorrectly billed by Respondent.

In its answer, dated November 7, 2018, Respondent denied the allegations that Petitioner was incorrectly billed. Respondent contended that services were supplied and billed in accordance with terms and conditions and rate schedules set forth in its Board approved Tariff. Respondent requested that the relief sought be denied on the basis that Petitioner failed to set forth a claim upon which relief may be granted.<sup>1</sup>

On December 19, 2018, the Board transferred the matter to the OAL for a hearing as a contested case pursuant to N.J.S.A. 52:14B-1 et seq. and N.J.S.A. 52:14F-1 et seq.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> A number of submissions followed the answer, and were filed prior to the transfer of the matter by the Board to the Office of Administrative Law ("OAL"). The details of those submissions are irrelevant in consideration of the final disposition of this matter.

The case was assigned to Administrative Law Judge ("ALJ") Kimberly A. Moss on January 7, 2019. During the subsequent February 28, 2019 conference, the parties engaged in settlement discussions and, after that date, the parties voluntarily agreed to resolve the matter and entered into a signed Stipulation of Settlement ("Stipulation") that was submitted to the ALJ on March 6, 2019.

Pursuant to the terms of the Stipulation, and in order to fully resolve this matter, Respondent agreed to credit Petitioner's account in the amount of \$872.04, with Petitioner remaining on the Equal Monthly Payment for \$330.00. Further, Petitioner was reenrolled in the Worryfree Protection Plan for one Premier Hot Water Boiler.<sup>2</sup>

By Initial Decision issued on March 8, 2019, and submitted to the Board on April 4, 2019, ALJ Moss found that the Stipulation was voluntary, its terms fully disposed of all issues in controversy, it was consistent with the law, and that it satisfied the requirements of N.J.A.C. 1:1-19.1.

After review of the Initial Decision and the Stipulation, the Board <u>HEREBY</u> FINDS that the parties have voluntarily agreed to the settlement as evidenced by their signatures and that, by the terms of the Stipulation, they have fully resolved all outstanding contested issues in this matter. Accordingly, the Board <u>HEREBY</u> <u>ADOPTS</u> the Initial Decision and the Stipulation executed by the parties in their entirety as if fully set forth herein.

The effective date of this Order is May 18, 2019.

AIDA CAMACHO-WELCH

SECRETARY

DATED: 5/8/19 BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES BY: FIORDALISO IOSEPH'L. PRESIDENT DIANNE SOL COMMISSIONER COMMISSIONER **UPENDRA J. CHIVUKULA** ROBERT M. GORDON COMMISSIONER **COMMISSIONER** machillelas ATTEST:

<sup>2</sup> Because the Worryfree Protection Plan is a contract service offered by Petitioner, it is not subject to the Board's jurisdiction. To the extent the terms of the settlement include payment, reimbursement, or other negotiated provisions regarding the Worryfree Protection Plan, the Board takes no position as to those

HEREBY CERTIFY that the within

document is a true copy of the original in the files of the Board of Public Utilities.

BPU DOCKET NO. EC18101100U OAL DOCKET NO. PUC 00217-19

2

terms.

Agenda Date: 5/8/19 Agenda Item: VIIA

## KATHLEEN RUTLER

#### ٧.

## **PUBLIC SERVICE ELECTRIC & GAS COMPANY**

## BPU DOCKET NO. EC18101100U OAL DOCKET NO. PUC 00217-19

#### SERVICE LIST

Kathleen Rutler 14 Burma Road Wyckoff, NJ 07481

Danielle Lopez, Esq. Public Service Electric and Gas Company 80 Park Plaza, T5G Newark, NJ 07102

Eric Hartsfield, Director Julie Ford-Williams, Chief Division of Customer Assistance Board of Public Utilities Post Office Box 350 Trenton, NJ 08625-0350 Eric.hartsfield@bpu.nj.gov Julie.ford@bpu.nj.gov

Patricia Krogman, DAG Department of Law & Public Safety Division of Law Post Office Box 45029 Newark, NJ 07101-45029 Patricia krogman@law.njoag.gov

> BPU DOCKET NO. EC18101100U OAL DOCKET NO. PUC 00217-19

3

## Apr. 4.2019 10:03AM



State of New Jersey OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

> INITIAL DECISION SETTLEMENT OAL DKT. NO. PUC 00217-19 AGENCY DKT. NO. EC18101100U

#### KATHLEEN RUTLER,

Petitioner,

v.

ŗ,

PUBLIC SERVICE ELECTRIC & GAS,

Respondent.

Kathleen Rutler, petitioner, pro se

Danielle Lopez, Esq., on behalf of respondent, PSE&G

Record Closed: March 7, 2019, 2019

Decided: March 8, 2019

BEFORE KIMBERLY A. MOSS, ALJ:

On January 7, 2019, this matter was transmitted to the Office of Administrative Law (OAL) for hearing as a contested case pursuant to N.J.S.A. 52:14B-1 to-15 and N.J.S.A. 52:14F 1 to-13. A telephone prehearing was conducted during which time the parties agreed on a date for a tollow up conference call. During the pendency of the February 28, 2019 conference the parties engaged in extensive settlement discussions. Another conference call was scheduled for March 25, 2019. Prior to that date, respondent submitted the fully executed settlement agreement resolving all issues in dispute. Said Agreement is attached hereto for reference.

New Jersey is an Equal Opportunity Employer

I have reviewed the record and terms of the Stipulation of Settlement and FIND:

- 1. The parties have voluntarily agreed to the settlement as evidenced by the signatures of the parties or their representatives.
- 2. The settlement fully disposes of all issues in controversy and is consistent with law.

I CONCLUDE that the agreement meets the requirements of N.J.A.C. 1:1-19.1 and therefore, it is ORDERED that the parties comply with the settlement terms and that these proceedings be and are hereby concluded.

I hereby FILE my initial decision with the BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES for consideration.

This recommended decision may be adopted, modified or rejected by the **BOARD OF PUBLIC UTILITIES**, which by law is authorized to make a final decision in. this matter. If the Board of Public Utilities does not adopt, modify or reject this decision within forty-five (45) days and unless such time limit is otherwise extended, this recommended decision shall become a final decision in accordance with N.J.S.A. 52:14B-10.

2

DATE .

KIMBERLY A. MOSS, ALJ

Date Received at Agency: Date Mailed to Parties: lib

### Apr. 4, 2019 10:03AM

Danielle Lopez Assistant General Regulatory Counsel Law Department 80 Park Plaza, T5, Newark, New Jersey 07102-4194 Tel: 973.430.6479 fax: 973.645.5983 Email: Danielle.Lopez@pseg.com



2819 BAS

1

Ũ

9 ti ti

125

: ....

March 6, 2019

## Via UPS Overnight Delivery

Honorable Kimberly Moss Office of Administrative Law 33 Washington Street Newark, NJ 07102

> Re: Rutler, Kathleen v. PSE&G OAL Docket No. PUC 00217-2019N BPU Docket No. EC 18101100U Stipulation of Settlement

Dear Judge Moss:

Enclosed please find an executed Stipulation of Settlement Agreement by the parties that resolves the issues in the above-referenced matter.

We thank Your Honor for her consideration of this submission.

Vory truly yours,.

Danielle Lopez

Enclosure

ce: Kathleen Rutler (via overnight delivery) James Walsh, PSE&G (via hand delivery)

#### STATE OF NEW JERSEY

OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE LAW

Kathleen Rutler

Petitioner.

v.

) BPU DOCKET NO. EC18101100U

) OAL DOCKET NO. PUCO0217-2019N

) STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT

Public Service Electric & Gas Company

Respondent.

On or about October 15, 2018, Petitioner filed the above-referenced billing dispute (the "Petition"). Public Service Electric & Gas Company ("PSE&G" or "Respondent") filed an answer to the Petition and the New Jersey Board of Public Utilities ("NJBPU" or "Board") transmitted the matter to the Office of Administrative Law ("OAL") as a contested case for adjudication.

In the interests of resolving this matter amicably and to avoid further delay and costs to petitioner and respondent (collectively, the "parties"), the parties hereto agree to settle this matter in accordance with the following terms:

1. Although not agreeing with the merits of the allegations expressed in the Petition, and expressly denying any liability or wrongdoing, PSE&G agrees to credit Kathleen Rutler's PSE&G account number ending in 300, at the premise of 14 Burma Road, Wyckoff, N.J. in the amount of \$872.04. This credit will be reflected on the next monthly bill which will be rendered on or about February 20, 2019.

2. Petitioner agrees and understands that no claims or grievances can be later adjudicated relating to the matters referenced in the Petition. Petitioner further agrees to take any and all measures necessary to effectuate the dismissal of the Petition with prejudice, including contacting the OAL or Board if necessary to request dismissal with prejudice of the Petition.

3. Petitioner further agrees and understands that she will remain on the Equal Monthly Payment (EPP) for \$330.00. Any credit amount from the settlement will be applied to EPP trailer. In the PSE&G bill for April 2019 petitioner will receive a charge or credit for any difference between what was credited and the charges for what was actually consumed.

4. The petitioner will be reenrolled for the WorryFree Protection Plan for 1 Premier Hot Water Boiler.

5. Petitioner agrees to keep this settlement agreement confidential, and not to disclose its existence or terms to anyone with the following exceptions: (1) legal counsel, for the sole purpose of obtaining legal advice related to this agreement; (2) an immediate family member (defined as petitioner's parent, spouse or child); (3) a tenant at or subsequent owner of the 14 Burma Road, Wyckoff, NJ, 07481; (4) to personnel of the Board or OAL; and (5) if petitioner is required to disclose this agreement by law.

7. The undersigned agree that this settlement contains mutually balancing and interdependent provisions and is intended to be accepted and approved in its entirety. In the event any particular aspect of this settlement is not accepted and approved by the Board or modified by the Board, the party that is adversely affected by the modification can either accept the modification or declare this settlement to be null and void, and the parties shall be placed in the same position that they were in immediately prior to its execution.

Date: 2-1-19

Date: 3-

James Walsh PSE&G Respondent

Kathleen Rutler Petitioner

6. Henceforth, there shall be no further transfer of charges from account number (Including trailer charges) of any kind; the Old Account shall henceforth be disassociated and "divorced" from Petitioner and her property at 14 Burma Road, and PSE&G shall henceforth have no recourse against Petitioner or her property for any balance due related to the Old Account.

Initialed by James Walsh for PSE&G, Respondent

Kathleen Rutler, Potitioner