



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of Ivory Williams,
Paralegal Specialist (M0867T),
Newark

Examination Appeal

CSC Docket No. 2016-3574

ISSUED: ~~NOV~~ 16 2016 (RE)

Ivory Williams appeals the determination of the Division of Agency Services which found that she did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination for Paralegal Specialist (M0867T), Newark.

The subject examination announcement was issued with a closing date of December 1, 2015. The examination was open to residents of Newark City who met the announced requirement of graduation from an accredited college or university with an Associate's degree as a Legal Assistant or in Paralegal Studies, or an Associate or Bachelor's degree and a Certificate of Proficiency in Paralegal Studies. A Juris Doctorate (JD) degree could be substituted for this education. Also, two years of experience in the preparation of drafts of contracts, briefs, motions, affidavits, or other legal documents and/or experience in the analysis of judicial decisions, legal opinions, rulings, memoranda, and other legal material, and the preparation of summaries of the points of law involved, could be substituted for the required education. The appellant was found to be below minimum requirements in education. It is noted that three candidates appear on the eligible list, which has been certified once, but no appointments have yet been made. There are two provisional incumbents serving, including the appellant.

The appellant indicated on her application that she possessed a Bachelor's degree in Criminal Justice. She also listed an internship with the Newark Prosecutor's office for one year (part-time, 15 hours per week) and four positions on her application: provisional Paralegal Specialist with the Newark Prosecutor's office, Administrative Assistant with the City of Newark's Mayor's Office, Operation

Counselor with the Community Education Center, and Substitute Teacher with the Newark Board of Education (part-time, 20 hours per week). The appellant's education was not accepted.

On appeal, Ms. Williams reiterates that she has a Bachelor's degree in Criminal Justice, and she states that she has two years of experience as a Paralegal Intern. She also requests that her experience as an Operations Counselor be considered.

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.3(b) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the open competitive examination announcement by the closing date.

CONCLUSION

The appellant was provisionally appointed to the title of Paralegal Specialist effective April 15, 2015, and continues in this appointment, and she possesses a Bachelor's degree in Criminal Justice. While she does not possess the proper Paralegal education, such as an Associate's degree in the required areas or a Certificate of Proficiency in Paralegal Studies, in possessing a Bachelor's degree in Criminal Justice, she has demonstrated a satisfactory level of education. See *In the Matter of Ann Marie Casabianca et al.* (CSC, decided June 6, 2007), and *In the Matter of Elizabeth Deal et al.* (CSC, decided February 24, 2010). She also continues to accrue experience in her provisional position. While there are three names on the eligible list, there are two provisionals serving. As such, it is expected that the eligible list will be incomplete when one appointment is made. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:1-1.2(c) indicates that the Commission may relax *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.3(b) for good cause in order to effectuate the purpose of Title 11A, New Jersey Statutes. Based on these unique circumstances, the Commission will accept the appellant's education and experience in lieu of the required education and admit her for prospective appointment only.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be granted.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON
THE 10th DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2016



Robert M. Czech
Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries
and
Correspondence

Director
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P. O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Ivory Williams
Jack Kelly
Kenneth Connolly
Joseph Gambino

