The Performance Assessment Review Program:

A Key to Implementing and Sustaining the Performance Budgeting Initiative
Goals of the Civil Service Commission regarding the Performance Assessment Review:

• Accountability

• Flexibility

• Sustainability
Accountability

• Statute and Regulations regarding performance evaluations for New Jersey State government

• PAR Guidance via the LMS (Learning Management System)

• e-PAR (Electronic Performance Assessment Review)
Performance Assessment Review

Statutory Basis is N.J.S.A. 11A:6-28, which states:

1. “The commission (Civil Service Commission) shall establish an employee performance system for State employee in the career and senior executive services. The system shall utilize standards and criteria related to job content and program goals...”

2. “The Civil Service Commission shall adopt and enforce rules with respect to the utilization of performance ratings in promotion, layoff or other matters.”
Performance Assessment Review

Regulations are in the New Jersey Administrative Code, N.J.A.C. 4A:6-5.1, et seq.

- **Who**: “a PAR program shall apply to all employees in the career service, and those in unclassified titles as designated by particular departments or agencies.”

- **How**: “The PAR program shall use standardized forms and rating scales for different performance appraisal models to be designated by the Department of Personnel”

- **When**: “At the end of six months and at the end of one year, the employee and the supervisor shall review the employee’s performance. The supervisor shall designate an interim performance rating at the end of six months and a final rating at the end of one year.”

Performance Assessment Review

Any Good Performance System Must:

- Link performance to Core Mission Areas, Goals, and Strategies
- Tie individual results to program results
- Measure individual results
- Enable skill development and job enrichment
Performance Assessment Review

- Performance Factors
- Job Achievement Factors

- These factors are directly related to the outcomes of the job: Section 1 - Major Goals, Job Responsibility, and Essential Criteria

- The Organization predetermines Job Achievement Factors
Performance Assessment Review

Major Job Responsibilities Should:

- **Contribute** to the Goals and Objectives
- Be **Critical** to the job
- Require a significant amount of **Time**
- Include any that are **Required** by Statute or Regulation
- Be Done **Often**
- Accurately reflect the **Actual Work** over which employee has control (responsibility, authority and resources to act)
Performance Assessment Review

Essential Criteria

What are they?

- Essential Criteria are statements of conditions that exist when a job responsibility has been completed successfully. Try to measure in outcomes, rather than outputs, when applicable.

How many are required?

- At least one (1) Essential Criteria for every Major Job Responsibility
Principles of Essential Criteria

**S**pecific
**M**easurable
**A**ttainable
**R**easonable
**T**ied to the Goals of the Organization
Supervisor’s Tips for Preparing Employee Evaluations

Your role as the supervisor should be to shape and develop efficient and effective work performance and behaviors. In an effort to make your meeting with your employees as pleasant and beneficial as possible, consider the following tips:

1. Schedule the meeting well in advance and advise employees of the meeting purpose; indicate what work products and/or required documents should be prepared and brought to the meeting.
2. Review the employee’s departmental file including:
   - job description and performance expectations;
   - letters/emails of commendation or complaints;
   - documentation or notes on previous performance discussions;
   - samples of work products;
   - anything else relevant to work behaviors and performance.
3. Determine what questions you will ask to get the information you need to complete the assessment.
4. Focus on the performance and behavior of the worker, not the worker.
5. Identify and establish the job responsibilities and your performance expectations.
6. Identify training needs and/or methods to improve his/her performance and competencies.
7. Identify what motivates your employees considering their future goals and aspirations.
8. Identify how customers, peers and team members view his/her performance.
9. Identify any conduct or performance issues (if applicable indicate date of incident).
10. Identify actions or behaviors employee will need to take to make improvements.
11. Identify what resources or support, if any, will be provided to assist the employee in making the required improvement?
12. Be mindful of the common rating errors:
   - **Leniency Error** - Giving everyone high ratings
   - **Central Tendency Error** - Clustering all employees in the middle to avoid extremes
   - **Recency Error** - Allowing recent events to carry more influence
   - **Contrast Error** – Comparing one employee’s performance to another
   - **Halo Effect Error** - Allowing favored traits or work factors to influence all other areas of performance
   - **Horns Effect Error** - Allowing a disfavored trait or work performance to overwhelm other, more positive performance elements
13. Reflect on your behaviors as a supervisor; have you given adequate time, attention, mentoring, coaching and support
e-PAR (Electronic PAR)

- CSC has received the required Technical approvals.
- CSC conducted a focus group with HR Directors across State Departments and Agencies.
- The e-Par system will be part of the My New Jersey portal.
- CSC is preparing the design details and requirements.
- CSC is working toward a single entry system that would include electronic approvals, and required system reporting.
- It is estimated that the e-PAR system will be ready by September 2013
Flexibility

- Job Banding and the Competency Assessment Review
Job Banding

Getting the right people, with the right skills, in the right jobs, at the right time
Conceptual Basis

Core Mission Areas

Staffing Plan

Performance Budgeting

Strategic Plan

Key Performance Indicators
What Is Job Banding?

- Job Banding is a competency based human resource process where similar job titles are grouped together to form career bands.

- Advancements are based on a multi-faceted approach including:
  - An organizational strategic staffing plan
  - Attainment of competencies
  - Structured interview
Why Job Banding?

- To make the organizational structure relevant to the core mission
- Tie individual performance to organization performance indicators
- To develop a more cohesive and functionally relevant workplace
Who Benefits?

The Organization by:
• Increasing employee productivity and efficiency by boosting competence levels;
• Encouraging advancement tied to successful work performance

Management by:
• Getting expanded scope, increased responsibility, and greater flexibility in deploying and promoting employees
• Seeking out and enhancing the skill set of innovative and creative employees by aligning competencies more closely to their jobs

Employees by:
• Providing the chance to acquire and demonstrate higher-level competencies
• Getting the tools to grow through training and career development
• Boosting confidence through skill enhancement
• Increasing opportunity for mobility
Elements of the Job Banding Pilot

1. Pilot Program Proposal
2. Strategic Staffing Plan
3. Competency Assessment Reviews
4. Vacancy and Selection Process
5. Employee Training and Development
Step 1: Pilot Program Proposal

- Through a pilot project – N.J.A.C. 4A:1
- Began in July 2012
- Impacted titles in Civil Service Commission:
  - Human Resources Consultant Series
  - Test Development Specialist Series
  - Personnel and Labor Analyst Series
- Impacted titles in OMB:
  - State Budget Specialist Series

*The supervisory level of each title series is not included in the pilot.*
Step 2: Strategic Staffing Plan

- Strategic staffing plan is the “roadmap” for the agency that sets forth a future organizational structure based on:
  - optimal staffing ratios;
  - right-sizing the organization; realigning positions, and
  - reducing costs for current and future needs

- Strategic staffing plans differ from traditional staffing activities, which are mainly focused on filling empty seats with new employees
Why Use a Staffing Plan?

• The plan provides an operational guideline for the organization to make strategic staffing decisions based on fulfilling the core mission and achieving the performance indicators.

• It gives managers the structure, tools, and process for defining and addressing the staffing implications of operational planning.
Why Use a Staffing Plan?

- The Plan responds to organizational changes driven by:
  - reduced funding
  - expanded services
  - changes in technology
  - anticipated reduction of the number of workers
  - changing needs of customer base.
Step 3: Competency Assessment Review (CAR)

- What is a Competency?
  - A competency is a set of defined behaviors that provide a structured guide enabling the identification, evaluation and development of the behaviors in individual employees.

- What is the Competency Assessment Review Form (CAR)?
  - Tool used to evaluate the designated competencies
How Competency Model was Developed

1. Specialized workgroup in the Division of Classification & Personnel Management
2. Analyzed job specifications
3. Analyzed PARS and work experience
4. Identified and defined core competencies
How Core Competencies Were Defined
Based on Dreyfus Model of 5 Levels of Competency Development*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core Competencies</th>
<th>Dreyfus Stages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contributing</td>
<td>Novice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journey Person</td>
<td>Beginner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advanced</td>
<td>Competent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Proficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Expert</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Dreyfus Novice to Expert Scale

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Knowledge</th>
<th>Autonomy</th>
<th>Coping with Complexity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Novice</td>
<td>Minimal or “textbook knowledge”</td>
<td>Needs close supervision or instruction</td>
<td>Little or no conception of dealing with complexity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beginner</td>
<td>Working knowledge of key aspects</td>
<td>Able to achieve some steps using own judgment, but needs supervision for overall task</td>
<td>Appreciates complex situations but only able to achieve partial resolution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competent</td>
<td>Good working &amp; background knowledge</td>
<td>Able to achieve most tasks using own judgment</td>
<td>Copes with complex situations through deliberate analysis &amp; planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proficient</td>
<td>Depth of understanding of discipline and area of practice</td>
<td>Able to take full responsibility for own work (and that of others where appropriate)</td>
<td>Deals with complex situations holistically, decision-making more confident</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expert</td>
<td>Authoritative knowledge and deep tacit understanding across area of practice</td>
<td>Able to take responsibility for going beyond existing standards</td>
<td>Holistic grasp of complex situations, moves between intuitive &amp; analytical approaches with ease</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Management/Supervisor Role

- Communicate & foster job banding concept
- Learn and administer new processes
- Evaluate competencies
- Enhance career development plans
Step 4 - Vacancy and Selection Process

- Vacancy Announcement
- Selection Process
- Structured Interview Process
Vacancy Announcement

An open position is an opportunity to be creative, proactive, and forward thinking in order to create the building blocks for a future organization.

Lose One, Fill One

We can no longer afford to simply fill a position when it becomes open.
Vacancy Announcements

Things to Consider:

- How is the position related to the core mission?
- What are the critical needs of the agency weighed against the budget restraints?
- What are the benefits of filling the position?
- What are the consequences of not filling it?
- What are the work demands of the position?
- What competencies are needed?
- How has it changed since it was last vacant?
- Must the position be backfilled at the same level, different level or at all?
Vacancy — Determined by Staffing Plan → Agency-wide Posting → Employees who have achieved ALL competencies are eligible to apply. → Competency Form has been filed with Office of Human Resources during PAR cycle

Collection of Interested Applicants → Initial Review by Office of Human Resources → Structured Interviews → Selection of Applicant
Factors to Be Considered in the Selection Process

Performance Management Elements:

• Competency Attainment

• Structured Interview

• PAR

• Not Seniority
Step 5: Employee Development

• Provide employees with tools to improve Performance

• Including but not limited to:
  • Formal Training
  • On the Job Training
  • Special Projects
Training and Career Development

• Conduct an electronic training needs assessment

• Receive and analyze survey results for valued feedback, priorities, and training needs

• Develop a training implementation plan

• Conduct training courses
Training and Career Development

Methods of Training:

• Classroom Training
  Partnering With The New Jersey Community College Consortium For Workforce And Economic Development (NJCC Consortium)

• E-Learning (Learning Management System) courses on-line
## Comparison of Performance Management Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Job Specifications</th>
<th>PARS</th>
<th>CARS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focus</strong></td>
<td>Knowledge, Skills, Abilities</td>
<td>Tasks Achievement</td>
<td>Successful Behaviors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose</strong></td>
<td>What are the Requirements for the job</td>
<td>What Tasks should be done</td>
<td>How you should perform tasks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Used to Evaluate</strong></td>
<td>Qualifications</td>
<td>Task Performance</td>
<td>Behaviors Necessary for Job</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scope</strong></td>
<td>Broad</td>
<td>Narrow</td>
<td>Broad &amp; Narrow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Frequency of Use for Individual</strong></td>
<td>Infrequent – to qualify for a job</td>
<td>Semi- Annually</td>
<td>Semi Annually until full achievement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## CSC Competency Assessment Review (CAR)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Competency</th>
<th>HRC Trainee to 1 Level</th>
<th>TDS Trainee to 1 Level</th>
<th>HRC1 to 2 Level</th>
<th>PLA1 to 2 Level</th>
<th>TDS1 to 2 Level</th>
<th>HRC 2 to 3 Level</th>
<th>PLA 2 to 3 Level</th>
<th>TDS 2 to 3 Level</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Analytical &amp; Problem Solving Skills</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication Skills</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer Relations</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership Skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning &amp; Organizational Skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self -Management</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soft Skills</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teamwork</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Knowledge</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technology Skills</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Number</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Supervisor’s Observations

• Specific – use actual examples and relate to definitions described.

• Observable – behaviors that you have seen, heard, read, etc.

• Actual Performance - tie to actual performance, not length of service

• Relate to Achievement of Big Picture- tie employee contribution to performance indicators, unit goals and objectives
Sustainability

• The N.J. S.T.E.P. Program
The N.J. S.T.E.P. Program

The N.J. S.T.E.P. Program (Supervisory Training Empowering Performance) is designed to provide supervisors in NJ government with skills that will build and enhance their foundational understanding of the roles, tasks and practices of effective supervision. Through interactive activities and classroom exercises, students will build their competence in applying these concepts in the workplace.
The N.J. S.T.E.P. Program

The N.J. S.T.E.P. Program was designed with input from our State customers to capture the needs of the target population: supervisors who may be new to the role as well as supervisors who have mastered the transition but have not received formal training in supervisory practices.

The program has been developed in partnership with the County College Consortium who will take the lead in delivering the training.
The N.J. S.T.E.P. Program

N.J. S.T.E.P. is a 7 day (42 hour) program that consists of 12 modules that have been organized around 3 main principles essential to the success of supervisors.

1. **Managing Yourself** - Leadership; Making the Transition from Co-Worker to Supervisor; Communication-Verbal; Communication-Written;

2. **Managing Others** - Performance Management; Motivation; Managing Change and Resistance; Addressing Workplace Conflicts;

3. **Managing the Work** - Planning and Organizing; Team Effectiveness; Problem Solving and Decision Making; and Cultural Competence.
The N.J. S.T.E.P. Program

**Performance Management** – Developing an understanding of managing the performance of direct reports through job planning and standards setting, feedback, coaching, performance evaluation and employee development.

**By the end of this module students will be able to:**

- Explain the purpose and benefits of performance management to employees
- Identify job tasks and set performance standards
- Describe seven criteria for meaningful performance feedback
- Identify the four requirements and five skills of the masterful coach
- Name and explain the actions of each step of the coaching process
- Describe how human nature, culture and personal ethos play a role in human response to being evaluated.
- Name and define thirteen common supervisory biases and errors in rating employee performance
- Identify the evaluation model and form used in the State of NJ
- Describe the supervisor’s responsibility and activities in developing employees
- Identify the concept of mentoring in the employee development process.
The Buck Stops Here!

“I have ordered the Treasurer to begin using this data to help determine what agencies will be allowed to spend in the future, and which agencies will be cut back for not performing. In this administration, we will pay for performance; not for failure.”

Governor Chris Christie from www.YourMoney.NJ.gov
Thank You!

Questions?

• Contact: Christopher.Randazzo@csc.state.nj.us

• N.J. S.T.E.P.: Wayne Jeter, Education Program Development Specialist, Civil Service Commission; Phone: (609) 777-1558 or Wayne.Jeter@csc.state.nj.us